# Verifiable Delay Functions from Supersingular Isogenies and Pairings 

Luca De Feo ${ }^{1}$ Simon Masson ${ }^{2} \quad$ Christophe Petit ${ }^{3} \quad$ Antonio Sanso ${ }^{4}$<br>${ }^{1}$ IBM Research Zürich, CH .<br>${ }^{2}$ Thales and Université de Lorraine, Nancy, FR.<br>${ }^{3}$ University of Birmingham, UK.<br>${ }^{4}$ Adobe Inc. and Ruhr Universität Bochum, DE.

December 9th, 2019

## Definition and examples

Definition and examples

VDF based on isogenies and pairings

Implementation and comparison

## Definition

A verifiable delay function (VDF) is a function $f: X \longrightarrow Y$ such that

1. it takes $T$ steps to evaluate, even with massive amounts of parallelism
2. the output can be verified efficiently.

## Definition

A verifiable delay function (VDF) is a function $f: X \longrightarrow Y$ such that

1. it takes $T$ steps to evaluate, even with massive amounts of parallelism
2. the output can be verified efficiently.

- Setup $(\lambda, T) \longrightarrow$ public parameters $p p$
- $\operatorname{Eval}(p p, x) \longrightarrow$ output $y$ such that $y=f(x)$, and a proof $\pi$ (requires $T$ steps)
- Verify $(p p, x, y, \pi) \longrightarrow$ yes or no.


## Application. Distributed randomness

Application. Distributed randomness

Application. Distributed randomness


## Application. Distributed randomness



## Application. Distributed randomness



## Application. Distributed randomness



Idea: slow things down by adding delay.

## Application. Distributed randomness



## VDF based on RSA.

Setup. $\mathbb{Z} / N \mathbb{Z}$ where $N$ is a RSA modulus

## VDF based on RSA.

Setup. $\mathbb{Z} / N \mathbb{Z}$ where $N$ is a RSA modulus Evaluation. $y=x^{2^{T}} \bmod N$.

## VDF based on RSA．

Setup． $\mathbb{Z} / N \mathbb{Z}$ where $N$ is a RSA modulus
Evaluation．$y=x^{2^{T}} \bmod N$ ．
Verification．The evaluator also sends a proof $\pi$ to convince the verifier．

## VDF based on RSA.

Setup. $\mathbb{Z} / N \mathbb{Z}$ where $N$ is a RSA modulus
Evaluation. $y=x^{2^{T}} \bmod N$.
Verification. The evaluator also sends a proof $\pi$ to convince the verifier.

- Wesolowski verification. [Eurocrypt '19]
$\pi$ is short
Verification is fast.
- Pietrzak verification. [ITCS '19]
$\pi$ computation is more efficent
Verification is slower.
Different security assumptions.


## VDF based on RSA．

If one knows the factorization of $N$ ，the evaluation can be computed using

$$
h(x)^{2^{T}} \equiv h(x)^{2^{T} \bmod \varphi(N)} \quad \bmod N
$$

Need a trusted setup to choose $N$ ．

## VDF based on RSA.

If one knows the factorization of $N$, the evaluation can be computed using

$$
h(x)^{2^{T}} \equiv h(x)^{2^{T} \bmod \varphi(N)} \quad \bmod N
$$

Need a trusted setup to choose $N$. This VDF also works in another group of unknown order.

## VDF based on RSA.

If one knows the factorization of $N$, the evaluation can be computed using

$$
h(x)^{2^{T}} \equiv h(x)^{2^{T} \bmod \varphi(N)} \quad \bmod N
$$

Need a trusted setup to choose $N$.
This VDF also works in another group of unknown order.
VDF based on class group. Let $K=\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-D})$ and $O_{K}$ its ring of integers.

$$
\operatorname{ClassGroup}(D)=\operatorname{Ideals}\left(O_{K}\right) / \text { Principalldeals }\left(O_{K}\right)
$$

This group is finite and it is hard to compute \#ClassGroup $(D)$.

VDF based on RSA.
If one knows the factorization of $N$, the evaluation can be computed using

$$
h(x)^{2^{T}} \equiv h(x)^{2^{T} \bmod \varphi(N)} \quad \bmod N
$$

Need a trusted setup to choose $N$.
This VDF also works in another group of unknown order.
VDF based on class group. Let $K=\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-D})$ and $O_{K}$ its ring of integers.

$$
\operatorname{ClassGroup}(D)=\operatorname{Ideals}\left(O_{K}\right) / \text { Principalldeals }\left(O_{K}\right)
$$

This group is finite and it is hard to compute \#ClassGroup $(D)$.

| VDF | pro | con |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| RSA | fast verification | trusted setup <br> not post-quantum |
| Class group | small parameters | slow verification <br> not post-quantum |

## VDF based on isogenies and pairings

## Definition and examples

VDF based on isogenies and pairings

Implementation and comparison

Our new verifiable delay functions.

1. Use isogenies to compute the evaluation step.
2. Use a pairing equation to verify the evaluation.

## Our new verifiable delay functions.

1. Use isogenies to compute the evaluation step.
2. Use a pairing equation to verify the evaluation.

- What is an isogeny ?
- What is a pairing ?


## Pairing-friendly elliptic curves.

Definition
A pairing is a bilinear non-degenerate application

$$
e: \mathbb{G}_{1} \times \mathbb{G}_{2} \longrightarrow \mathbb{G}_{3}
$$

where $\mathbb{G}_{i}$ are groups of prime order $r$.

## Pairing-friendly elliptic curves.

## Definition

A pairing is a bilinear non-degenerate application

$$
e: \mathbb{G}_{1} \times \mathbb{G}_{2} \longrightarrow \mathbb{G}_{3}
$$

where $\mathbb{G}_{i}$ are groups of prime order $r$.
For an elliptic curve, we can choose $\mathbb{G}_{1}=\langle P\rangle$ and $\mathbb{G}_{2}=\langle Q\rangle$ with $P, Q$ points of the curve of order $r$.
A curve is pairing-friendly if $P$ and $Q$ are efficiently computable.

## Pairing-friendly elliptic curves.

## Definition

A pairing is a bilinear non-degenerate application

$$
e: \mathbb{G}_{1} \times \mathbb{G}_{2} \longrightarrow \mathbb{G}_{3}
$$

where $\mathbb{G}_{i}$ are groups of prime order $r$.
For an elliptic curve, we can choose $\mathbb{G}_{1}=\langle P\rangle$ and $\mathbb{G}_{2}=\langle Q\rangle$ with $P, Q$ points of the curve of order $r$.
A curve is pairing-friendly if $P$ and $Q$ are efficiently computable.
Applications. BLS signature, identity-based encryption, etc.

## Isogenies of elliptic curves.

Definition (Isogeny)
An isogeny between two elliptic curves $E$ and $E^{\prime}$ is an algebraic map $\varphi$ such that $\varphi\left(0_{E}\right)=0_{E^{\prime}}$.

## Isogenies of elliptic curves.

Definition (Isogeny)
An isogeny between two elliptic curves $E$ and $E^{\prime}$ is an algebraic map $\varphi$ such that $\varphi\left(0_{E}\right)=0_{E^{\prime}}$.

- Isogenies of elliptic curves are also group morphisms.
- In our case, the degree of an isogeny is the size of its kernel.
- Isogenies of small degree are efficiently computable.


## Isogenies of elliptic curves.

Definition (Isogeny)
An isogeny between two elliptic curves $E$ and $E^{\prime}$ is an algebraic map $\varphi$ such that $\varphi\left(0_{E}\right)=0_{E^{\prime}}$.

- Isogenies of elliptic curves are also group morphisms.
- In our case, the degree of an isogeny is the size of its kernel.
- Isogenies of small degree are efficiently computable.

Example. $E: y^{2}=x^{3}-x$ and $K=(1,0)$ of order 2 .

$$
\begin{aligned}
\varphi: & E \\
(x, y) & \longmapsto E /\langle K\rangle \\
& \longmapsto\left(\frac{x^{2}-x+2}{x-1}, y \frac{x^{2}-2 x-1}{x^{2}-2 x+1}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Isogenies of elliptic curves.

## Definition (Isogeny)

An isogeny between two elliptic curves $E$ and $E^{\prime}$ is an algebraic map $\varphi$ such that $\varphi\left(0_{E}\right)=0_{E^{\prime}}$.

- Isogenies of elliptic curves are also group morphisms.
- In our case, the degree of an isogeny is the size of its kernel.
- Isogenies of small degree are efficiently computable.

Example. $E: y^{2}=x^{3}-x$ and $K=(1,0)$ of order 2 .

$$
\begin{aligned}
\varphi: & E \\
(x, y) & \longmapsto E /\langle K\rangle \\
& \longmapsto\left(\frac{x^{2}-x+2}{x-1}, y \frac{x^{2}-2 x-1}{x^{2}-2 x+1}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

From $\varphi: E \rightarrow E^{\prime}$, there always exists a dual isogeny $\hat{\varphi}: E^{\prime} \rightarrow E$ such that $\varphi \circ \hat{\varphi}=[\operatorname{deg} \varphi]$.

## Isogenies of elliptic curves.

## Definition (Isogeny)

An isogeny between two elliptic curves $E$ and $E^{\prime}$ is an algebraic map $\varphi$ such that $\varphi\left(0_{E}\right)=0_{E^{\prime}}$.

- Isogenies of elliptic curves are also group morphisms.
- In our case, the degree of an isogeny is the size of its kernel.
- Isogenies of small degree are efficiently computable.

Example. $E: y^{2}=x^{3}-x$ and $K=(1,0)$ of order 2 .

$$
\begin{aligned}
\varphi: & \longmapsto \\
(x, y) & \longmapsto E /\langle K\rangle \\
& \longmapsto\left(\frac{x^{2}-x+2}{x-1}, y \frac{x^{2}-2 x-1}{x^{2}-2 x+1}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

From $\varphi: E \rightarrow E^{\prime}$, there always exists a dual isogeny $\hat{\varphi}: E^{\prime} \rightarrow E$ such that $\varphi \circ \hat{\varphi}=[\operatorname{deg} \varphi]$.

$$
e(\varphi(P), Q)=e(P, \hat{\varphi}(Q))
$$

Two types of elliptic curves:


Two types of elliptic curves:
Ordinary curves End $(E)$ is an order in $\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-D})$.


Two types of elliptic curves:
Ordinary curves End $(E)$ is an order in $\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-D})$.


Two types of elliptic curves:
Ordinary curves End $(E)$ is an order in $\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-D})$.


Two types of elliptic curves:
Ordinary curves $\operatorname{End}(E)$ is an order in $\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-D})$.
Supersingular curves $E n d(E)$ is a maximal order in the quaternion algebra $\mathbb{Q}_{p, \infty}$.


Two types of elliptic curves:
Ordinary curves $\operatorname{End}(E)$ is an order in $\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-D})$.
Supersingular curves $E n d(E)$ is a maximal order in the quaternion algebra $\mathbb{Q}_{p, \infty}$. Supersingular curves can be defined over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$.


Two types of elliptic curves:
Ordinary curves End $(E)$ is an order in $\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-D})$.
Supersingular curves $\operatorname{End}(E)$ is a maximal order in the quaternion algebra $\mathbb{Q}_{p, \infty}$.
Supersingular curves can be defined over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$.
Looking only curves defined over $\mathbb{F}_{p}, \operatorname{End}_{p}(E)$ is an order in $\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-p})$.


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).
Verification Check that $e(P, \hat{\varphi}(Q))=e(\varphi(P), Q)$.


VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).
Verification Check that $e(P, \hat{\varphi}(Q))=e(\varphi(P), Q)$.


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

VDF over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ supersingular curves.
Setup A public walk in the isogeny graph.
Evaluation For $Q \in E^{\prime}$, compute $\hat{\varphi}(Q)$ (the backtracking walk).
Verification Check that $e(P, \hat{\varphi}(Q))=e(\varphi(P), Q)$.


Not post-quantum, but also no proof of evaluation needed!

Isogeny shortcut.

$$
y^{2}=x^{3}+x
$$

Isogeny shortcut.


## Isogeny shortcut.

If $E$ has a known endomorphism ring, a shortcut can be found!


## Isogeny shortcut.

If $E$ has a known endomorphism ring, a shortcut can be found!

## Unknown endomorphism ring.

- Ordinary curves. Pairing friendly $\rightarrow$ small discriminant $\rightarrow$ known End $(E)$.



## Isogeny shortcut.

If $E$ has a known endomorphism ring, a shortcut can be found!

## Unknown endomorphism ring.

- Ordinary curves. Pairing friendly $\rightarrow$ small discriminant $\rightarrow$ known End $(E)$.
- Supersingular curves.

Open problem: compute a supersingular elliptic curve of unknown endomorphism ring.


## Isogeny shortcut.

If $E$ has a known endomorphism ring, a shortcut can be found!

## Unknown endomorphism ring.

- Ordinary curves. Pairing friendly $\rightarrow$ small discriminant $\rightarrow$ known End $(E)$.
- Supersingular curves.

Open problem: compute a supersingular elliptic curve of unknown endomorphism ring.

## Trusted setup.

## Isogeny shortcut.

If $E$ has a known endomorphism ring, a shortcut can be found!

## Unknown endomorphism ring.

- Ordinary curves. Pairing friendly $\rightarrow$ small

$$
y^{2}=x^{3}+x
$$ discriminant $\rightarrow$ known End $(E)$.

- Supersingular curves.

Open problem: compute a supersingular elliptic curve of unknown endomorphism ring.

## Trusted setup.

- Start from a well known supersingular curve,


## Isogeny shortcut.

If $E$ has a known endomorphism ring, a shortcut can be found!

## Unknown endomorphism ring.

- Ordinary curves. Pairing friendly $\rightarrow$ small discriminant $\rightarrow$ known End $(E)$.
- Supersingular curves.

Open problem: compute a supersingular elliptic curve of unknown endomorphism ring.

## Trusted setup.

- Start from a well known supersingular curve,
- Do a random walk,



## Isogeny shortcut.

If $E$ has a known endomorphism ring, a shortcut can be found!

## Unknown endomorphism ring.

- Ordinary curves. Pairing friendly $\rightarrow$ small discriminant $\rightarrow$ known End $(E)$.
- Supersingular curves.

Open problem: compute a supersingular elliptic curve of unknown endomorphism ring.

## Trusted setup.

- Start from a well known supersingular curve,
- Do a random walk,
- Forget it.


## Isogeny shortcut.

If $E$ has a known endomorphism ring, a shortcut can be found!

## Unknown endomorphism ring.

- Ordinary curves. Pairing friendly $\rightarrow$ small discriminant $\rightarrow$ known End $(E)$.
- Supersingular curves.

Open problem: compute a supersingular elliptic curve of unknown endomorphism ring.

## Trusted setup.

- Start from a well known supersingular curve,
- Do a random walk,
- Forget it.
$E$ has an unknown endomorphism ring.

Isogenies over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ and class group.

$$
E_{1} \xrightarrow{\varphi_{1}} E_{2}
$$

Isogenies over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ and class group.


Isogenies over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ and class group.


Isogenies over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ and class group.


## Isogenies over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ and class group.



## Security of our VDF.

- Our VDFs are secure on a classical computer.
- The $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ VDF is insecure on a quantum computer:
- Once the setup is done, compute $\# \mathrm{Cl}(D)$.
- Evaluate the $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ VDF with ideal multiplications faster than isogenies.
- The $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ VDF is insecure on a quantum computer.

It is quantum-annoying in the sense that you need to run Shor's algorithm for each evaluation of the VDF.

# Implementation and comparison 

## Definition and examples

VDF based on isogenies and pairings

Implementation and comparison

Computing isogenies.

- Method 1. Degree 2 isogenies using 2-torsion points:
$E \quad E_{1} \quad E_{2} \quad E_{3} \quad E_{4} \quad E_{5} \quad E_{6} \quad E_{7} \quad E_{8} \ldots \bullet-\bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet E_{T-1} E^{\prime}$

Computing isogenies.

- Method 1. Degree 2 isogenies using 2-torsion points:


Time complexity: $T$ isogenies of degree 2 . Storage complexity: $O(T)$.

Computing isogenies.

- Method 1. Degree 2 isogenies using 2-torsion points:


Time complexity: $T$ isogenies of degree 2 .
Storage complexity: $O(T)$.

- Method 2. Degree $2^{n}$ isogenies using $2^{n}$-torsion point:

$E_{4}$
$E_{8}$


## Computing isogenies.

- Method 1. Degree 2 isogenies using 2-torsion points:


Time complexity: $T$ isogenies of degree 2 .
Storage complexity: $O(T)$.

- Method 2. Degree $2^{n}$ isogenies using $2^{n}$-torsion point:


Time complexity: $T / n$ isogenies of degree $2^{n} \approx T \log _{2}(n)$ degree 2 isogenies. Storage complexity: $O(T / n)$.
In practice (for large $T$ ), $\log _{2}(n)$ is small and it can be useful to reduce the storage.

Choice of parameters.

$$
\# E\left(\mathbb{F}_{p}\right)=p+1
$$

## Choice of parameters.

$$
\# E\left(\mathbb{F}_{p}\right)=p+1
$$

- DLP over the curves.
$P$ and $Q$ of order $r$ with $\log _{2}(r) \approx 256$. so we set $p=f r-1$ with $f$ a cofactor.
bits of $p: \quad r \quad \bar{f}$


## Choice of parameters.

$$
\# E\left(\mathbb{F}_{p}\right)=p+1
$$

- DLP over the curves.
$P$ and $Q$ of order $r$ with $\log _{2}(r) \approx 256$. so we set $p=f r-1$ with $f$ a cofactor.
- DLP over the finite field $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$.

NFS over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}: \log _{2}(p) \approx 1500$. We need a cofactor of size $\log _{2}(f) \approx 1250$.
bits of $p: r$

## Choice of parameters．

$$
\# E\left(\mathbb{F}_{p}\right)=p+1
$$

－DLP over the curves．
$P$ and $Q$ of order $r$ with $\log _{2}(r) \approx 256$ ．so we set $p=f r-1$ with $f$ a cofactor．
－DLP over the finite field $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ ． NFS over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}: \log _{2}(p) \approx 1500$ ．We need a cofactor of size $\log _{2}(f) \approx 1250$ ．
－From a point of order $2^{n}$ ，we can compute a degree $2^{n}$ isogeny in $O\left(n \log _{2}(n)\right)$ degree 2 isogenies．


Choice of parameters.

$$
\# E\left(\mathbb{F}_{p}\right)=p+1
$$

- DLP over the curves.
$P$ and $Q$ of order $r$ with $\log _{2}(r) \approx 256$. so we set $p=f r-1$ with $f$ a cofactor.
- DLP over the finite field $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$. NFS over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}: \log _{2}(p) \approx 1500$. We need a cofactor of size $\log _{2}(f) \approx 1250$.
- From a point of order $2^{n}$, we can compute a degree $2^{n}$ isogeny in $O\left(n \log _{2}(n)\right)$ degree 2 isogenies.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { bits of } p: r \quad 2^{1244} f \\
& p=r \cdot 2^{1244} \cdot f-1
\end{aligned}
$$

## Implementation.

- Proof of concept in SageMath : https://github.com/isogenies-vdf.
- Parameters chosen for 128 bits of security
- Arithmetic of Montgomery curves
- Isogeny computation with recursive strategy
- Tate pairing computation.


## Implementation．

－Proof of concept in SageMath ：https：／／github．com／isogenies－vdf．
－Parameters chosen for 128 bits of security
－Arithmetic of Montgomery curves
－Isogeny computation with recursive strategy
－Tate pairing computation．

| Protocol | Step | $\mathbf{e}_{k}$ size | Time | Throughput |
| :---: | :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ graph | Setup | 238 kb | - | $0.75 \mathrm{isog} / \mathrm{ms}$ |
|  | Evaluation | - | - | $0.75 i \mathrm{isog} / \mathrm{ms}$ |
|  | Verification | - | 0.3 s | - |
| $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ graph | Setup | Evaluation | 491 kb | - |
|  | Verification | - | - | $0.35 i s o g / \mathrm{ms}$ |
|  |  | - | 4 s | - |

Table：Benchmarks for our VDFs，on a Intel Core i7－8700＠ $3.20 \mathrm{GHz}, T \approx 2^{16}$

| VDF | pro | con |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| RSA | fast verification | trusted setup |
| Class group | no trusted setup <br> small parameters | slow verification |
| Isogenies <br> over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ | Fast verification | trusted setup |
| Isogenies <br> over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ | Quantum－annoying <br> Fast verification | trusted setup |


| VDF | pro | con |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| RSA | fast verification | trusted setup |
| Class group | no trusted setup <br> small parameters | slow verification |
| Isogenies <br> over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ | Fast verification | trusted setup |
| Isogenies <br> over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ | Quantum-annoying <br> Fast verification | trusted setup |

## Open problems.

- Hash to the supersingular set (in order to remove the trusted setup)

| VDF | pro | con |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| RSA | fast verification | trusted setup |
| Class group | no trusted setup <br> small parameters | slow verification |
| Isogenies <br> over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ | Fast verification | trusted setup |
| Isogenies <br> over $\mathbb{F}_{p^{2}}$ | Quantum-annoying <br> Fast verification | trusted setup |

## Open problems.

- Hash to the supersingular set (in order to remove the trusted setup)
- Find a fully post-quantum VDF

Thank you for your attention.

